CATHOLIC SPIRITUALITY VS WORKPLACE SPIRITUALITY
WHAT ARE THE POINTS OF CONTACT?

Mykolas Deikus[1] and Jolita Vveinhardt[2*]

[1] *Vytautas Magnus University, Faculty of Catholic Theology, Department of Theology, Gimnazijos St. 7, Kaunas, LT-44260, Lithuania*
[2] *Vytautas Kavolis Interdisciplinary Research Institute, Vytautas Magnus University, Donelaicio St. 52, Kaunas, LT-44246, Lithuania*

Abstract

The managerial workplace spirituality project, which has aimed to create a universal conception of spirituality, reduced the understanding of spirituality. It turned out that the workplace was not as secular as expected, and the diversity of circulating conceptions of spirituality caused confusion not only for scholars but also for practitioners. This review explains how the perspectives of Catholic and secular spirituality can enrich each other and reduce terminological confusion in scientific research. A mixed methodological approach of bibliometric and narrative analysis was applied. The search in the Web of Science database yielded 604 articles on workplace spirituality and 737 articles on Catholic spirituality. Using the VOSviewer software, thematic maps of both research fields were created, and the contexts of overlapping terms were identified and discussed. It has been found that themes in both research fields diverged. Although only 12.9 and 10.2 percent of terms in the religious and secular perspective, respectively, overlapped, many of them were understood differently and had different contexts. The paper discusses how the Catholic approach to the person, the relationship to other persons and the environment, the diversity of spiritual practices could enrich the agenda of research on work environment, while the diversity of themes, which emerged in the managerial perspective and their reflection could broaden the field of research on Catholic spirituality. Directions for further research are also projected.

Keywords: Catholic, workplace, secular, religion, management

1. Introduction

Spirituality is a widespread word that is used in contemporary cultures in both religious and secular cultural and scientific contexts. Since it is difficult to avoid contact with different cultures and viewpoints in the global world (unless one chooses self-isolation), De Col believes that understanding different contexts helps to know oneself and contributes to the dialogue between different

---

*Corresponding author, e-mail: jolita.vveinhardt@vdu.lt

cultures of spirituality: cultures differ, the human state unites, and the Spirit inspires and changes both of them [1]. Knowledge of different contexts manifesting themselves in specific interpretations of spirituality is important not only in science, but also in practice - in the modern work environment, where chaplaincy emerges as a peculiar manifestation of workplace spirituality [2].

However, a multiple problem emerges in the modern work environment. Despite efforts to relegate religiosity to the private sphere of human life, Fotaki and her colleagues note that the belief that the progress and modernity of the Enlightenment project inevitably leads to the collapse of religion has proven false, since the world (with some exceptions) remains highly religious [3]. Signs of scientific interest in workplace spirituality can be noticed as early as at the beginning of the 20th century, but the breaking point is considered to be the turn of the century [3, 4]. The return to the interest in religious and non-religious workplace spirituality is shown by the increasing interdisciplinary research in recent decades [2, 5], although top scientific journals still avoid this theme [3].

Although it is acknowledged that workers have their inner life that feeds them and that is fed by meaningful work taking place in a community context [6], social sciences eschew religion in research on spirituality and focus on function rather than content [7]. In addition, unlike researchers of other areas of social sciences, scholars of management and organisational studies are quite reluctant to admit the resurgence of religions and spirituality as a social and cultural phenomenon. The scholarly literature on faith and management is relatively sparse, highly diverse, and more closely related to the most recent management fad of 'workplace spirituality' [8].

The problem is not only the low level of interest in religious spirituality at work, but also the diversity of conceptions of spirituality. On the one hand, a number of authors tend to distinguish between religious and spiritual beliefs [7-11]. It is maintained that spirituality can be conceptually separated from religion and that spirituality is the search for meaning and essence, while religion constitutes specific beliefs, practices, historical and institutional arrangements that complement this search [7].

On the other hand, the postmodern society faces a problem of diversity of definitions of spirituality. In the Christian context, spirituality is primarily associated with the Catholic tradition, since, according to Honecker, it is relatively new in Protestant language usage [12]. When Catholics use the term 'spirituality', they mean the intensity of the Christian life while following Jesus and growing in a constant and meaningful personal relationship to the Trinity and loving relationship to all people [13]. However, who examined the development of the conception of spirituality in the Catholic context of the United States, pointed out trends causing problems when defining spirituality - the tendency to interpret the term according to certain areas (e.g. 'American spirituality', 'women's spirituality', 'lay spirituality', and etc.) [14]. Even greater diversity exists in social sciences, lacking a definitive and universally accepted definition of spirituality in general [5, 15].

Thus, better understanding of the specificity of using the term 'spirituality' in the contexts of research on religion and organisational management, as well as of existing trends requires access to analyse a large number of publications. One of these is the bibliometric research method using the VOSviewer software. This method is applied when performing content analysis [16] and allows processing large volumes of publications, reviewing key themes and scientific research trends [17, 18]. Only one bibliometric analysis in the research field of spirituality was found in the scientific literature databases. da Silva Lopes et al., who performed the analysis, concluded that there was a need for additional research on spirituality, which would focus on the non-economic aspect [4]. However, the authors of this study did not examine contexts related to Catholic spirituality, and the field of social research was not defined by spirituality in the work environment. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to determine the specificity of using the term spirituality in the Catholic and organisational management sciences contexts.

To achieve this aim, three tasks are formulated:
1. to discuss the conceptions of spirituality in the contexts of Catholic theology and organisational management science,
2. to identify the main themes of Catholic spirituality and work spirituality in the scientific literature,
3. to compare how the same terms related to spirituality are treated in Catholic and secular management science contexts.

2. Methods

In order to achieve the purpose of the research, the mixed methodological strategy of narrative and co-word co-occurrence analysis was applied. The co-word analysis is one of the science mapping techniques that allows to explore the content of the publication [16]. The co-occurrence analysis finds links between concepts that occur together in article titles, keywords or abstracts [19]. In this case, it is assumed that keyword clusters reveal key themes, and keyword co-occurrence is interpreted as a reflection of links between key concepts (keywords) [20]. According to Zupic and Čater, this is the only method where the similarity measure is identified according to the actual content of documents, while other bibliometric methods link documents indirectly through citations or co-authorship [19]. The analysis was performed employing the open-source VOSviewer version 1.6.20 software.

The keyword co-occurrence analysis is a quantitative content analysis method that can be used in conjunction with the content analysis [16]. Since the same terms can be used in different contexts, it is necessary to read individual articles that fall into a specific field of research. Therefore, a narrative (also called semi-systematic) literature review method of the scientific literature was used for the qualitative content analysis [21]. Unlike the meta-analysis, this method is not limited to empirical studies alone, but also allows the examination of conceptual works.

The research consisted of several stages. In the first stage, the selection of scientific publications on the Web of Science database was carried out. Using the search keywords 'Catholic AND spirituality' and after specifying the religion category, 737 scientific articles published since 1990 were found. Further, using the keywords 'workplace AND spirituality', the search in the categories assigned to organisational management yielded 604 articles (since 1990).

In the second stage, the search for terms related to both research fields was carried out. Using the software, a standard minimal recurrence threshold of 10 terms was set for articles that fell into both research fields. That is, the term is included in the analysis only if it occurs at least 10 times in the text. This way, terms that occur randomly in the texts are rejected. In the field of research on Catholic spirituality, 285 terms were filtered out of a total of 11616 terms. Further, each of them is examined and those that are not related to the field of study are discarded. Finally, 116 terms remained. In the field of research on work spirituality, out of 11516 terms, 368 were filtered out, and 147 terms were left for further analysis.

Thematic groups in the maps made by scientific mapping are marked in different colours. The sizes of the circles represent the 'weight' of a particular term in the research field, which in this case was calculated in a binary way. The distances between the circles show how closely the terms are related, and the lines denote links with other terms. All terms are converted to a singular grammatical form and written in lowercase letters.

In the third stage, the terms that fell into both research fields were compared - this way, 15 overlapping terms were found. Using overlapping terms in the lists of both research fields as keywords, publications for the qualitative content analysis were selected. Priority was given to the most cited publications (bearing in mind recognition). If the publications found were not cited, the most recent ones were prioritised. Thus, in the end, 55 articles were selected for the field of workplace spirituality and 57, of Catholic spirituality.

3. Results

3.1. Definitions of spirituality in theological and management science contexts

According to Honecker, religious spirituality means piety, the practice of faith, as well as religiosity and mysticism [12]. In a general sense, this is related to the right way of life, which is outlined by a particular faith. In this context, Catholic spirituality is primarily based on following Christ, as a way of maintaining the holiness received from God and of improving one's life - to bear resemblance to the image of God (cf. Lumen Gentium 40). O'Donnell accentuates that a person who has been brought into the life of Jesus through Baptism begins to share the divine nature as Jesus shared the human nature (of course, not to the same degree). By taking up his cross and becoming totally

dependent on the will of the Father, he is becoming increasingly more like Christ not only by actions but also in the depths of his soul [13].

The spiritual practice leading to holiness in the Catholic Church can be concretized by following one or another tradition; for example, Ignatian, Franciscan, Marian, charismatic spirituality, etc. A specific path of spirituality, according to Nweke, outlines the way in which one surrenders to Christ [22]. In this path, religiosity, piety, sacramental practice and spiritual life are inseparable from each other, although understanding the latter in the secular society can be problematic. According to Kohut, the conception of spiritual life follows from the all-pervading action of the third divine person [23]. Therefore, the conception of spiritual life should be defined as sacramental life in the mystery of Jesus Christ by the power of the Holy Spirit.

In the postmodern context, especially with the growing popularity of interdisciplinarity trends and the penetration of psychology science ideas into the theological sphere, the element of experience is often emphasised in the conception of spirituality (spiritual life). The experience, which is reflected on and lived, includes emotional and cognitive processes, and therefore does not reflect the holistic Christian conception of the man as a unity of the body and spirit. Therefore, Frohlich emphasizes that when talking about spirit and spirituality, it is impossible to do without philosophical and theological concepts that may seem 'archaic' [24]. According to her, the fully functioning human spirit refers to an essential human dimension that is radically engaged with the reality (both contingent and transcendent). This means that spiritual life takes place under the influence of the greatest inner human potential (spirit) in the fullness of interpersonal, communal and mystical relationships.

Spirituality as understood in a secular context is radically different from the understanding discussed above. The conception of workplace spirituality, which is also referred to as 'new spirituality', varies. For some, it means affirming God and the Gospel in the workplace. Meanwhile, for followers of the 'New Age' fad, it is nothing more than the acknowledgement of the importance of feelings and the 'new consciousness' [9]. Such understanding is close to the views of scholars who are suspicious of specific religious rituals.

Some authors define spirituality using concepts such as energy, meaning, and knowing and refer to Taoist, Buddhist, Hindu, Zen or Native American traditions when describing concepts that encompass all aspects of human life (from work to leisure) [25]. Highly cited Giacalone and Jurkiewicz defined workplace spirituality as a structure of organisational values, confirmed in the organisational culture, which promotes employees' transcendence experiences in the work process and facilitates their sense of relation to others in a way that would provide a state of completeness and joy. According to the authors, this includes two dimensions: beliefs, emotions, relationships and a functional aspect, which manifests itself through productivity, absenteeism, stress, health, leadership [26]. This shows that spirituality is understood in the framework of cognitive and emotional mental processes and to the extent that it can be useful for organisational performance. This understanding is related to several trends.

First, although more than just material human needs are recognized, the instrumental function of spirituality, as it is understood, becomes apparent. According to Van Buren and Greenwood, the practice of spirituality and religion in the workplace is used only to enhance existing business strategies and monetary motives [27]. Burack partly accepted the reproaches that workplace spirituality ideas in creating a more welcoming work environment and enriching the human experience involved soft or deceptive management or a thinly disguised attempt to promote a religious revival in corporate America [28]. However, criticising an overly utilitarian conception of workplace spirituality, Lynn et al. noted that main research on workplace spirituality followed a functional approach, limiting spirituality to values that exist at the organisational level and focused on outcomes. This approach allows researchers to avoid the sacred and normative nature of spirituality, but provides no tools to address the significant realities of the postmodern workplace, such as religious pluralism in the workplace and integration of faith and work [7].

Second, there is no clear consensus on the place of spirituality understood from a religious perspective in the modern workplace. Lynn et al. proposed that spirituality should not be separated from religion, and therefore basically followed the Christian conception of work. For example, work is considered worship, prayer and gift to God, work contributes to the common good, co-workers are cared for as those who are the image of God, etc. [7]. Meanwhile, other authors analysing the conception of workplace spirituality tend to separate spirituality from religiosity. It is stated that spirituality is not related to any particular religion [9] and the focus should be on the 'inner' aspect of religion. That is, on contemplation and reflection rather than religious rituals [10]. This way, religiosity, and at the same time, spirituality, is reduced to cognitive processes. Therefore, the signs of workplace spirituality are the employee's sense of trustworthiness, confidence and the possibilities of personal fulfilment, which are related to the company's leaders, managers and co-workers [28].

Authors avoiding the conception of religious spirituality explain their approach by the fact that rituals create boundaries around 'us', namely, the religious community and 'them' who are outside the community [10], promote hatred and hostility towards 'strangers', divide the society or even threaten democracy [9]. In addition, the search for religious and spiritual meaning in the workplace is seen as a deviation from a more traditional business mentality [25]. Cavanagh, who opposes this approach, is convinced that movement of spirituality in business helps the entrepreneur to focus more on the important things in life: God, people, family and the physical world that we can pass on to our children. This allows the business person to better understand the role of God and other people in our world [9].

Thus, after a brief discussion of different approaches to spirituality, the results of the bibliometric analysis are presented below, showing the main thematic trends that have emerged in the fields of research on Catholic spirituality and workplace spirituality.

3.2. The research field of Catholic spirituality

Three main groups of themes were identified in the field of research on Catholic spirituality. The first group (in red) denotes the theme of the Church (96 recurrences of the term, 107 links, and the total strength of links is 497) and its 62 related sub-themes. That is, 'Church' in this theme is the strongest term that has general interaction with other terms in the text content.

The second group (in green) consists of the theme of religiosity (71 recurrences of the term, 88 links, and the total strength of links is 318), this group contains 40 sub-themes. The third group (in blue colour) consists of the topic of education (49 recurrences of the term, 90 links, the total strength of links is 272) (Figure 1).

Figure 1. A network of themes that make up Catholic spirituality.

Since the saved figures are not interactive and show only general trends, Table 1 lists ten terms that carry the most weight.

The table shows ten words with the highest weight in the research field. Although the Church received the greatest attention, in the overall context of terms, the occurrence of this term in the texts accounted for just over 3%. In addition, it should be noted that such words (terms) as spirit, religious practice, liturgy, Christ, holiness, mysticism, priesthood, grace were even weaker and ranked only around the middle in the list of terms. This shows that they receive relatively little attention in scientific publications. In general, keywords such as God, Trinity, Mary did not exceed the set co-occurrence threshold, which again shows that the authors paid little attention to this.

Table 1. Terms forming the field of research on Catholic spirituality*.

Terms	Group	Links	Total strength of links	Co-occurrence percent
church	1	107	496	3.1
world	1	107	383	2.3
theology	1	94	348	2.5
catholic church	1	99	323	2.1
religiosity	2	88	318	2.4
belief	2	89	282	2
effect	2	93	272	1.8
education	3	90	272	1.7
woman	2	87	254	1.7
dialogue	1	87	248	1.7

* Note: Terms are given in the original language

The table also shows the estimated mean of years when the terms were used most often. In general, looking at the scientific activity in terms of time, it came to light that in the last five years, in addition to the dialogue that entered the top ten, more attention was paid to Christ, Pope Francis, love, pandemic, and resistance. In other words, these terms represent the most recent trends that were less frequently explored in previous years.

3.3. The research field of Management science

Five themes were identified in the field of research on organisational management. The first group (in red) consists of the theme of spirituality (309 recurrences of the term, 146 links, and the total strength of links is 2607). In other words, 'spirituality' is the strongest term that has general interaction with other terms in the text content.

The theme in the second group (in green) is employees (256 recurrences of the term, 146 links, and the total strength of links is 2506). The third group (in blue) consists of terms related to managers (106 recurrences of the term, 139 links, and the total strength of links is 1179). The topic in the fourth group (in khaki colour) is work (223 recurrences the term, 146 links, and the total strength of links is 2079). Finally, the fifth theme (in purple) is that of the organisation's leader (101 recurrences of the term, 141 links, and the total strength of links is 1056). The map of the themes making up the research field is presented in Figure 2, while the ten strongest terms are unfolded in Table 2.

The strongest term in this field of research was spirituality, whose occurrence in the texts reached almost 5% and which gained more attention around 2015. The arrangement of other terms shows that the researchers' attention was consistently focused on the effect of spirituality on the work environment (employees, interpersonal relationships, work, management, etc.). In general, research trends reveal that for the past five years, the most attention in this research field has been paid to the pandemic, employee well-being, work engagement, management, mindfulness, sustainability.

Thus, after a brief review of trends in both fields of research, the following section will discuss the meanings given to the same terms in different fields of research and the contexts in which they are used.

Figure 2. The map of themes making up the research field of Organisational management.

Table 2. Terms forming the research field of organisational management*.

Terms	Group	Links	Total strength of links	Co-occurrence percent
spirituality	1	146	2607	4.8
employee	2	146	2506	4
relationship	2	146	2385	1.6
organisation	1	146	2295	3.7
workplace	4	145	2204	3.7
workplace spirituality	2	145	2079	3.7
work	4	146	2079	3.5
originality value	2	140	1200	1.8
manager	3	139	1179	1.7
value	1	141	1125	1.6

* Note: Terms are given in the original language

3.4. Meanings of terms and contexts of their use

As already mentioned, 15 keywords were found, which were used in both research fields under analysis. These terms accounted for 12.9% of the list of terms representing the research field of Christian spirituality; and 10.2%, of workplace spirituality. Tables 3 and 4 show the contexts in which the terms unfold. Each of the terms is further discussed in light of both fields of research on spirituality.

Table 3. Use of terms in the research field of Catholic spirituality.

Terms	Co-occurrence	Links	Related terms	Context	Sources
belief*	60	89	individual, age, self, women, effect, model, religiosity, adult, health	Saint Augustine's spirituality	[29]
				The relation to the intelligence quotient	[30]
				Transgender individuals' belief in God's support and inherent value	[31]
				The experience of God in the context of modern man's feeling of abandonment	[32]
				Losing belief in purgatory	[33]
				Belief in life after death	[34]
				Cultivating love in devotion to Mary	[35]
challenge*	45	91	reflection, humanity, today, world, science, education, future, opportunity, love, reality	Diversity, secularization, individualisation and marketing of education	[36]
				Celebrating the Eucharist during the pandemic	[37]
				Pastoral education in the context of unbelief and indifference	[38]
				Illness as a challenge	[39]
education*	49	90	opportunity, child, young person, challenge,	The feeling, the integrating consciousness, weaving the	[40]

			student, teacher, future, today, spiritual dimension, religious education	threads of meaning and the spiritual quest	
				Teaching about spirituality and teachers' relationship to spirituality	[41]
				The relation between resilience and spirituality	[42]
health	39	70	effect, outcome, adolescent, resource, religiosity, belief, individual, adult, women, religious practice	The relation to long-term cardiovascular health	[43]
				Spiritual health	[44]
				Burnout of priests	[45]
hope	17	66	place, philosophy, mystery, dialogue, love, theology, today, education, effect, model	Communication with the God who transcends time	[46]
				The power of love, the glory of God, imago Dei and the gift as a basis for hope and spiritual growth	[47]
light*	32	79	Christian spirituality, world, love, teaching, mystery, dialogue, reality, heart, church, future	The influence of Confucianism on Korean Catholics	[48]
				Ecological consciousness in the perspective of God the Creator	[49]
				Spirituality of communion in a Trinitarian perspective	[50]
				A sense of identity, spirituality and otherness in the light of the Gospel and mysteries of the faith	[38]
order*	42	90	church, virtue, Jesus, history, existence, consciousness,	The Catholic spiritual tradition in the digital space	[51]

			liturgy, clergy, world, dialogue	Moral principles and God's order in existential experience	[52]
				A procession as a medium of socialisation	[53]
pandemic	10	35	Covid, health, opportunity	Experiences in an online Catholic prayer group	[54]
				Resilience, strengthening of social support and relations	[55]
				Transmission of Jesuit spirituality	[56]
patient*	25	56	religiosity, effect, support, stress, individual, belief, woman, age, model, strategy	Knowledge of patients' spiritual and religious problems	[57]
				Physicians' attitude towards patients' spirituality	[58]
				The relation between doctors' spirituality and patients' problem solving	[59]
religiosity*	71	88	patient, gender, adult, outcome, individual, belief, religious practice, stress, health	Life satisfaction	[60]
				Changes in spirituality and religiosity in people with Parkinson's disease	[61]
				Piety, practice of belief and mysticism	[12]
				Changes in young people's religiosity and relationship to the Church	[62]
				Models of religious devotion and determinants promoting religiosity among African Americans and white-skinned people in the United States	[63]

spirituality**	17	42	mysticism, woman	Catholic and Protestant	[12]
				Characteristics of Augustine's spirituality	[29]
				Characteristics of Franciscan spirituality	[64]
				Teaching about spirituality as a necessary component of human experience	[41]
				Bringing spiritual traditions online in the cases of Jesuits, Dominicans, Benedictines, Carmelites and Marians	[51]
				Feminist spirituality	[65]
stress*	15	46	life satisfaction, patient, religiosity, effect, belief, model, woman	Sexual abuse by clergy	[66]
				The role of spirituality and religiosity in responding to a cancer diagnosis	[67]
				Traumatic experience in a Biblical perspective	[68]
teacher*	20	60	school, religious education, catholic school, challenge, formation, teaching, spiritual dimension, student	A theological framework of spirituality as an opening to transformative dialogue and self-reflection	[69]
				The effect of teachers' spirituality	[70]
				Teachers' intrinsic spirituality	[71]
				The embodiment of Christ's mission to reveal the nearness of the kingdom of God	[38]

				Spiritual well-being in personal, communal, environmental and transcendental perspectives	[72]
thought*	18	55	church, age, world, today, theology, dialogue, teaching, age, behaviour, place	Spirituality in the perspective of social teaching of the Catholic Church	[46]
				Reconciliation of contemplative and active life	[73]
world	67	107	love, today, face, history, reality, existence, challenge, theology, mission, dialogue	Openness of Franciscan spirituality to the world and the apostolate 'in via'	[64]
				The relationship between the Catholic Church, the world's poor and care for the environment in the perspective of Creation	[74]
				Spirituality of communion in response to the world's desires	[50]
				Constant conversion, patience and openness to the God's word in relation to the rapidly changing world	[38]

Note: *10 strongest links, **only with the combination 'catholic spirituality'

Table 4. Use of terms in the research field of workplace spirituality.

Terms	Co-occurrence	Links	Related terms	Context	Sources
belief*	60	89	spirituality, workplace, religion, development, value, organisation, relationship, employee	Belief in the organisation and belief in oneself	[74]
				Part of the organisational culture	[28]
				Religious beliefs	[7]
				Belief in humanity	[10]
				Value systems or	[25]

				spirituality outside religion	
				Spiritual and religious beliefs related to transcendence (in a non-religious sense too)	[11]
challenge*	45	91	spirituality, workplace, workplace spirituality, work, organisation, employee, relationship, management, development, life, leader, religion,	Dedication to work	[75]
				Selflessness in public service	[76]
				Managerialism dependent on outcomes	[77]
				Integrating mind and emotions	[78]
				Customer service in high power cultures	[79]
education*	49	90	nurse, nursing, care, life, spirituality, workplace spirituality, development, organisation, manager, relationship	Employee well-being in education	[80]
				The ability to recognise and influence	[81]
				Understanding the effect of organisational silence	[82]
				Interpretation of the concept of spirituality in the academic community	[83]
health*	39	70	spirituality, workplace spirituality, organisation, employee, relationship, workplace spirituality	The relation of spirituality to mental and behavioural health	[84]
				The relation of spirituality to mental and physical health	[85]
hope	17	66	spirituality	A resource of psychological capital	[86]
				Prevention of workplace violence	[87]
				The effect on motivation	[87]
				Ethics of decisions	[88]
light*	32	79	employee, organisation, relationship, workplace spirituality	Mindfulness	[89]
order*	42	90	workplace,	Social Order in	[90]

			spirituality, value, development, work, organisation, manager, leader, employee, workplace spirituality	Sharia	
				Rejection and marginalisation of spirituality	[91]
				Obedience to God	[90]
				Platonic metaphysics	[92]
				Relating the Self to transcendence	[93]
pandemic	10	35	covid, employee, spirituality, work	Well-being in times of crisis	[94]
				Employees' belief restoration	[74]
				Employee agility	[95]
				Improving the performance of institutions	[96]
patient*	25	56	care, nurse, spirituality	Workplace mobbing and burnout	[97]
				Quality of patient care	[98]
religiosity*	71	88	management, religion, workplace, spirituality, faith, organisation, work, employee, manager, behaviour, relationship	Differences and similarities between generations	[99]
				Justice in an Islamic perspective	[90]
				Fraud prevention	[100]
				The effect on work performance	[101]
				The effect on employee well-being	[102]
spirituality**	17	42	workplace, faith, need, work, nature, order, experience, management, stress, value	Personal competencies	[103]
				Work ethics	[104]
				Organisational commitment	[105]
				Job involvement, organisational identification and job satisfaction	[106]
				Prevention of stress and ostracism	[107]
stress*	15	46	workplace, spirituality, need, life, work, organisation, originality value, employee, relationship, workplace spirituality, nurse	Teacher stress	[108]
				Workplace well-being	[80]
				The Dark Triad	[109]
teacher*	20	60	relationship	Stress reduction	[108]

				The relation to effectiveness and organisational citizenship	[110]
				Compassion, spiritual values based on Buddhism, selflessness	[111]
thought*	18	55	spirituality, work, organisation	Chaplaincy and changing the management thought	[112]
				Alternative thought and behaviour	[91]
				Eastern and Western spirituality	[113]
				Misapplication of Christian thinking	[114]
				Traditions of mindfulness	[115]
world	67	107	religion, workplace, spirituality, work, organisation, employee, relationship, workplace spirituality, community	Chaplaincy in a secular society	[112]
				Relations to changes	[4]
				God, prayer and a sustainable world	[9]

3.4.1. Belief

From a Catholic perspective, the term is found in the contexts related to the teaching (and acceptance) of the Catholic Church about purgatory, afterlife, gender reassignment, as well as while examining the individual's situation in the modern world and spiritual practices. The problems are analysed from the perspectives of the individual's age, gender, religiosity and health.

In the context of workplace spirituality, the English word 'belief' is commonly used in several senses. These are: 'beliefs' can refer to the organisation's cultural context [28], 'belief' as believing in the organisation and oneself [74], or religious and non-religious beliefs [11, 25]. Meanwhile, 'transcendence', borrowed from religion, refers to something that is more than a person, but not a deity [11].

3.4.2. Challenge

Attention is focused on the challenges of the modern society, posed by secularisation, individualism, diversity (nationality, culture, gender, etc.) in Catholic education and pastoral care. In addition, as a major challenge (e.g. for the celebration of the Eucharist), problems posed by the pandemic and responses

to the disease are addressed. In this context, not only the current situation is reflected, but also what awaits in the future, viewing from the perspectives of love and humanity.

Looking from the perspective of the management science, challenges pertain to the individual's dedication to work, to the contexts of problems arising in the organisation's activities, management, in which spirituality of employees can help.

3.4.3. Education

The theme of spirituality is examined in the context of religious education, focusing on the problems of spirituality of both students of different ages and teachers themselves. According to Silhol, spirituality unfolds in two important aspects: teaching about 'spirituality' as a necessary component of human experience and talking about personal experience, relation to 'spirituality' as evidence of sincere commitment and professionalism. In the work environment, the term is used in the contexts of educational staff well-being, staff and teaching students of management [41].

3.4.4. Health

From the Catholic perspective, health problems are viewed through the lens of religiosity, religious practice and belief, taking into account demographic and occupational/ministry dimensions. Meanwhile, the Management science focuses on employees' physical and mental health.

3.4.5. Hope

In the Catholic perspective, hope first emerges in the transcendental context, as a basis of personal growth. In this context, constituents such as love, mysticism, philosophical and theological approaches to the phenomenon and the applied aspect of education come to light.

From the perspective of organisational management, hope emerges as a constituent of the employee's psychological capital and a motivating factor related to work and ethics.

3.4.6. Light

Contexts of ecology, communion, identity and relationship to a different culture emerge in light of the teaching of the Catholic Church. In other words, it shows how religion can shape people's self-awareness and dialogue with the surrounding world. Meanwhile, in the management science, the term is commonly used metaphorically, for example, revealing the positive aspects of mindfulness and social capital.

3.4.7. Order

Catholic spirituality is revealed through the ways of expressing the tradition of spirituality in the historical perspective and in the modern digital space, through morality and virtues in the dialogical relationship of human existence to God. In organisations, it can mean social order, rules dictated by a philosophical or religious viewpoint.

3.4.8. Pandemic

According to the authors studying Catholic spirituality, spirituality is one of the areas whose relevance increases during various crises [54, 116]. In the research field of Catholic spirituality, attention was drawn to the use of digital technologies to create virtual communities of prayer, ways of transmitting spirituality when social contacts are limited, or to rethinking spirituality in light of the resilience theory. In this case, the Catholic response to the problems caused by covid-19 (stress, health, need for support, etc.) is highlighted.

In organisations, the term emerges in the contexts of employee performance, employee agility in difficult situations, well-being and restoration of belief in oneself and the organisation.

3.4.9. Patient

The term unfolds in the context of health care, from the perspective of physicians. That is, it is examined how physicians are able to recognise patients' spiritual needs, problems and how the solution of these problems is related to the spirituality of doctors themselves. Meanwhile, the managerial perspective highlights the contexts of healthcare workers' safety, well-being and quality of patient care.

3.4.10. Religiosity

In the Catholic perspective, the topic of spirituality emerges in the contexts of personal health, life satisfaction, relationship to the Church, age and cultural differences. In this case, issues of religious practices, belief, disease, gender and other are examined.

In the field of research on organisational management, the impact of religiosity on work performance, decision-making, and employee well-being is examined.

3.4.11. Spirituality

The contexts of significance of spirituality in human experience, manifestation of feminism in the Church, and different schools of Catholic spirituality related to monasticism were highlighted. Unlike in the Catholic

perspective, in the management science, the role of spirituality is analysed in the contexts of personal competencies, ethics, organisational commitment, and psychological health.

3.4.12. Stress

The role of spirituality is examined in the context of traumatic experiences and their coping. Meanwhile, from a managerial standpoint, spirituality is of interest as far as it is related to the quality of interpersonal relationships, coping with stressors in different professional activities.

3.4.13. Teacher

Christological, holistic (individual, community, environment, God) perspectives emerge in the context of teacher activity (in Catholic and non-Catholic schools). In research attributed to the field of management science, the term refers to the professional context, but the emphasis is on stress reduction, operational effectiveness, and values (not necessarily Christian).

3.4.14. Thought

Spirituality is examined in the contexts of organisations and personal life. They highlight the moral teaching of the Church and an integral approach to reconciliation of personal spiritual development with acting in the world. In this context, Eggensperger notes that neither a theological social ethic without a spiritual impetus nor spirituality without social references make sense [46].

In the perspective of organisations, the term emerges in the contexts of managerial, behavioural changes, as well as of influence of different religions and cultures on employees' relationship to work.

3.4.15. World

In the context of a dialogical relationship to the world, the missionary vocation of Church members is highlighted, lovingly responding to the expectations of sufferers and social and ecological problems of the times. From a managerial point of view, the situation of chaplaincy in organisations, changes and the relation of religious spirituality to sustainability are examined.

4. Conclusions

The Catholic conception of spirituality is radically different from the secular one that emerges in the managerial context. First of all, spirituality is understood as a Christocentric way of sanctification, the path of being conformed to God's image, following Christ. It is development inwardly and through action, a sacramental life in the mystery of Jesus Christ by the power of

the Holy Spirit. It can be defined as a path and an intensive process lasting a lifetime and inseparable from religious practices. Although it is about the individual's development, it is not egoistic, it is bound by the Church community and takes place in the community while serving it. Meanwhile, religious practices are being eliminated from the work capacity in the workplace or at least efforts are being made to relegate them to the private space. Although in principle concepts borrowed from theology, such as 'transcendence' are used, their meaning is changed so that the ultimate goal is not the individual, but the organisation and its goals. Spirituality is understood as the immaterial needs of employees in the emotional and cognitive sphere and as a psychological resource that can be used by a manipulative manager to encourage to make the desired decisions and work more effectively.

Three dominant themes have been identified in the research field of Catholic spirituality: the Church, personal religiosity, and education. These are the areas where researchers have delved most deeply. In this context, little attention was paid to liturgy, Christ, holiness, grace, mysticism, or different paths of Catholic spirituality. Five themes came to light in the research field of workplace spirituality: the topics of spirituality, employees, management, work performance, and leadership. That is, the researchers focused on how spirituality affected work capacity, interpersonal relationships, management quality, value climate.

A comparison of overlapping terms in both fields of research shows that in many cases researchers focused on different contexts and gave different meanings to the same terms. After removing the religious constituent from spirituality, the organisational culture (traditions, rituals, values, belief in the organisation, etc.) becomes an imitation of religion, and spirituality itself, understood as an intrinsic resource of the employee, is treated instrumentally. Although there were studies that tried to emphasize religion (Christianity and Islam), these were essentially single cases that did not change the prevailing secular approach. On the other hand, the attitude to the individual, the relationship to other persons and the environment, and the diversity of spiritual practices, which emerged in the research field of Catholic spirituality, could enrich the agenda of research on work environment. In addition, the variety of contexts, which was highlighted in the managerial perspective, reflection on contexts could broaden the thematic field of research on Catholic spirituality.

Acknowledgement

References

[1] R.Z.F. De Col, Spiritus: A Journal of Christian Spirituality, **16(2A)** (2016) 132.
[2] T. Wolf and B. Feldbauer-Durstmüller, Journal of Management, Spirituality & Religion, **15(1)** (2018) 38.

[3] M. Fotaki, Y. Altman and J. Koning, Organ. Stud., **41(1)** (2020) 9-12.

[4] D. da Silva Lopes, M.A.F.M. Filho, P. Hayashi and T.G. Torriani, Administração Pública E Gestão Social, **14(4)** (2022).

[5] R.K. Singh and S. Singh, Manage. Decis., **60(5)** (2022) 1296-1325.

[6] D.P. Ashmos and D. Duchon, J. Manage. Inquiry, **9(2)** (2000) 137.

[7] M.L. Lynn, M.J. Naughton and S. VanderVeen, J. Bus. Ethics, **85** (2009) 227-232.

[8] E. Bell and S. Taylor, Int. J. Soc. Res. Method., **17(5)** (2014) 547.

[9] G.F. Cavanagh, J. Organ. Change Manag., **12(3)** (1999) 186-193.

[10] P. Collins and N.K. Kakabadse, Public Administration and Development: The International Journal of Management Research and Practice, **26(2)** (2006) 109-116.

[11] K.A. Phipps, J. Bus. Ethics, **106(2)** (2012) 179-180.

[12] M. Honecker, Z. Theol. Kirche, **118(2)** (2021) 184.

[13] J. O'Donnell, Review & Expositor, **79(2)** (1982) 294.

[14] J. Farina, US Catholic Historian, **8(1/2)** (1989) 15.

[15] E. Weathers, G. McCarthy and A. Coffey, Nurs. Forum, **51(2)** (2016) 92-93.

[16] N. Donthu, S. Kumar, D. Mukherjee, N. Pandey and W.M. Lim, J. Bus. Res., **133(September)** (2021) 285-296, online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2021.04.070.

[17] Z. Gu, F. Meng and M. Farrukh, IEEE Access, **9** (2021) 34647-34659.

[18] S. Subramanian, J. Billsberry and M. Barrett, Management Review Quarterly, **73(4)** (2023) 1971-1999.

[19] I. Zupic and T. Čater, Organ. Res. Methods, **18(3)** (2015) 429-472.

[20] G.A. Ronda-Pupo and L.A. Guerras-Martin, Strateg. Manage. J., **33(2)** (2012) 162-188.

[21] H. Snyder, J. Bus. Res., **104(11)** (2019) 333-339.

[22] K.C. Nweke, Theol. Today, **75(2)** (2018) 236.

[23] P.V. Kohut, European Journal of Theology, **21(2)** (2012) 156-157.

[24] M. Frohlich, Spiritus: A Journal of Christian Spirituality, **1(1)** (2001) 71.

[25] K.C. Cash and G.R. Gray, Acad. Manage. Perspect., **14(3)** (2000) 126-127.

[26] R.A. Giacalone and C.L. Jurkiewicz, *Handbook of workplace spirituality and organizational performance*, R.A. Giacalone & C.J. Jurkiewicz (eds.), M.E. Sharpe, New York, 1999, 3-28.

[27] H.J. Van Buren and M. Greenwood, J. Bus. Ethics, **117** (2013) 708.

[28] E.H. Burack, J. Organ. Change Manag., **12(4)** (1999) 280-286.

[29] J. van Oort, Religion and Theology, **29(1-2)** (2022) 59.

[30] J.W. Lace and L.N. Evans, J. Relig. Health, **61(6)** (2022) 4516.

[31] J.N. Goh, Religions, **14(2)** (2023) 171.

[32] S. Głaz, J. Relig. Health, **60(5)** (2021) 3545-3561.

[33] J.E. Thiel, Theol. Stud., **69(4)** (2008) 741.

[34] A.B. Cohen and D.E. Hall, Int. J. Psychol. Relig., **19(1)** (2009) 39.

[35] Y-G. Lee, Religions, **14(4)** (2023) 554.

[36] T. van der Zee, International Studies in Catholic Education, (2023) 1-15, online at https://doi.org/10.1080/19422539.2023.2215653.

[37] E. Foley, Religions, **12(4)** (2021) 245.

[38] G. Morrison, The Australasian Catholic Record, **99(3)** (2022) 284-289.

[39] A. Büssing and J. Surzykiewicz, Religions, **6(3)** (2015) 763.

[40] B. Hyde, Int. J Child. Spiritua., **13(2)** (2008) 117.

[41] G. Silhol, Religions, **15(1)** (2024) 130.

[42] M.T. Caton and P. Watters, Journal of Religious Education, **71(2)** (2023) 139.

[43] E.K. Waters, Z. Doyle and E. Finlay, J. Relig. Health, **57(3)** (2017) 869-882.

[44] F. del Castillo, C.D. del Castillo and M. Alvarez, Religions, **11(7)** (2020) 371.
[45] S.J. Rossetti and C.J. Rhoades, Psychol. Relig. Spirit., **5(4)** (2013) 335.
[46] T. Eggensperger, Philippiniana Sacra, **57(174)** (2022) 451.
[47] D. Torevell and M. McHugh, International Journal of Christianity & Education, **26(3)** (2022) 315.
[48] P-G. Pak, J. Korean Relig., **8(1)** (2017) 185.
[49] I. Platovnjak, Nova prisutnost, **17(1)** (2019) 75.
[50] T. Gourlay, The Downside Review, **140(4)** (2022) 161.
[51] D. Douyere and C. Andrea, *Reading online spiritualities? Spiritual lines & traditions of Catholic French speaking prayer websites*, Proc. of 3rd International Comsymbol Colloquium on Religions(s), Secularity(ies), Society(ies) and the Digital Humanities Turn, Paul Valéry University of Montpellier Montpellier, 2016, 150.
[52] M. Da Rosa and L. Carlos, Revista de Literaturas e Teologias, **9(18)** (2019) 443.
[53] V. Keely, *Pilgrimage in practice: narration, reclamation and healing,* I.S. McIntosh, E.M. Quinn & V. Keely (eds.), CABI, Wallingford, 2018, 80-90.
[54] S. Keisari, G. Biancalani, E. Tavelli, S. Fassina and I. Testoni, Pastoral Psychol., **71(2)** (2022) 201.
[55] H.K. Bett, A. Ndunge, D. Mathuva and N. Njiraini, Pastoral Psychol., (2023) https://doi.org/10.1007/s11089-023-01106-7.
[56] F. Image, International Studies in Catholic Education, (2023) 1-15, online at https://doi.org/10.1080/19422539.2023.2171629.
[57] M.R.G. Esperandio, Y.Q. de Souza, O. Nadalin and R. Hefti, J. Relig. Health, **60(3)** (2021) 2154.
[58] M.R.G. Esperandio and G.A.S. Machado, J. Relig. Health, **58(4)** (2019) 1172.
[59] E. Voltmer, A. Büssing, H.G. Koenig and F. Al Zaben, J. Relig. Health, **53(6)** (2014) 1741-1752.
[60] S. Kim, E. Miles-Mason, C.Y. Kim and G.B. Esquivel, Psychol. Relig. Spirit., **5(1)** (2013) 33.
[61] S. Kéri and O. Kelemen, Religions, **7(6)** (2016) 73.
[62] R. Razum and B.V. Mandarić, Bogoslovska smotra, **89(5)** (2019) 1083.
[63] J.C. Cavendish, M.R. Welch and D.C. Leege, J. Sci. Stud. Relig., **37(3)** (1998) 397.
[64] M. Fiałkowski, Religions, **13(8)** (2022) 686.
[65] C. Gervais and C.T. Sjolander, Rev. Relig. Res., **57(3)** (2015) 365-396.
[66] J. Prusak and A. Schab, Arch. Psychol. Relig., **44(1)** (2022) 40.
[67] R.A. Lagman, G.J. Yoo, E.G. Levine, K.A. Donnell and H.R. Lim, J. Relig. Health, **53** (2014) 449.
[68] A. Šeremet, The Journal of Theology, Education, Canon Law and Social Studies Inspired by Pope John Paul II, **13(2)** (2023) 167.
[69] R. Madden, International Journal of Practical Theology, **25(2)** (2021) 184.
[70] A. Kennedy and J. Duncan, *International handbook of education for spirituality, care and wellbeing*, M. de Souza, L.J. Francis, J. O'Higgins-Norman & D. Scott (eds.), Springer, Dordrecht, 2009, 891.
[71] G. Elliott, J. McCormick and N. Bhindi, Brit. J. Relig. Educ., **41(2)** (2019) 134.
[72] J.W. Fisher, Int. J Child. Spiritua., **14(2)** (2009) 151.
[73] S. Almirzanah, HTS Teol. Stud. - Theol., **79(1)** (2023) 9168.
[74] L. Szrot, Journal for the Study of Religion, Nature & Culture, **14(2)** (2020) 226-227.
[75] J. Milliman, A. Gatling and J.S. Kim, Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management, **35(1)** (2018) 57.

[76] S. Hassan, N. Ansari and A. Rehman, Qualitative Research Journal, **22(2)** (2022) 209.

[77] D. Kokt and E.P. Palmer, SA Journal of Human Resource Management, **17(1)** (2019) 2.

[78] L.K. Dean, J. Organ. Change Manag., **17(1)** (2004) 20.

[79] D. Zhu, W. Bahadur and M. Ali, Humanities & Social Sciences Communications, **10(1)** (2023) 792.

[80] T. Na'imah, H.K. Tjahjono and A. Madjid, Quality-Access to Success, **24(193)** (2023) 257-258.

[81] H. Pirkola, P. Rantakokko and M. Suhonen, J. Nurs. Manage., **24(7)** (2016) 867.

[82] H.S. Kim and J.H. Song, Human Resource Development International, **27(2)** (2024) 257.

[83] L.A. Siddiqi, H. Chick and M. Dibben, *Responsible Leadership and Ethical Decision-Making (Research in Ethical Issues in Organizations)*, S. Savur & S. Sandhu (eds.), Emerald Publishing Limited, Bingley, 2017, 74.

[84] S.G. Mhatre and N.K. Mehta, Management Research Review, **46(9)** (2023) 1191-1192.

[85] H. Shava and W.T. Chinyamurindi, SA Journal of Human Resource Management, **19** (2021) a1437, online at https://doi.org/10.4102/sajhrm.v19i0.1437.

[86] A. Sarkar, N. Garg and S. Palo, Global Business Review, (2022) https://doi.org/10.1177/09721509221111445.

[87] A. Sarkar and N. Garg, Int. J. Confl. Manage., **31(5)** (2020) 713-721.

[88] F. Alshehri, M. Fotaki and S. Kauser, J. Bus. Ethics, **174(3)** (2021) 567.

[89] N. Burton and M.C. Vu, Eur. Manag. Rev., **18(1)** (2021) 141.

[90] M.M. Sulphey, Asian Journal of Business Ethics, **12(2)** (2023) 323-333.

[91] N. Zaidman and O. Goldstein-Gidoni, Group Organ. Manage., **36(5)** (2011) 631-634.

[92] T. Peltonen, Philosophy of Management, **18(3)** (2019) 240.

[93] M. Driver, Hum. Relat., **58(9)** (2005) 1095.

[94] S. Srivastava and P. Gupta, Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management, **50(March)** (2022) 375-388, online at https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1447677021002011.

[95] I. Saeed, J. Khan, M. Zada, R. Ullah, A. Vega-Muñoz and N. Contreras-Barraza, Psychology Research and Behavior Management, **15** (2022) 31-49, online at https://doi.org/10.2147/PRBM.S344651.

[96] S.M. Mohammed and R.E. Elashram, Leadership Organ. Dev. J., **43(4)** (2022) 623.

[97] Y. Fan, M. Cao, Y. Zhou, P. Duan and L. Xing, Nursing Open, **10(6)** (2023) 3872.

[98] F.I. Albuquerque, R.C. Cunha, L. Dias Martins and A. Brito Sá, J. Organ. Change Manag., **27(1)** (2014) 59.

[99] A.J. McMurray and C.A. Simmers, Vision, **24(1)** (2020) 70.

[100] P. Purnamasari and I. Amaliah, Procd. Soc. Behv., **211(2)** (2015) 827.

[101] A.M. Osman-Gani, J. Hashim and Y. Ismail, Empl. Relat., **35(4)** 2013 360.

[102] T. Koburtay, D. Jamali and A. Aljafari, Business Ethics, the Environment & Responsibility, **32(1)** (2023) 341.

[103] C.D. de la Cruz and R.E.P. Valdivieso, Business Ethics the Environment & Responsibility, (2023) 1-11, online at https://doi.org/10.1111/beer.12628.

[104] B.S. Pawar, J. Bus. Ethics, **90(3)** (2009) 375.

[105] S. Amin, S. Situngkir and D.M.F. Aira, The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business, **8(5)** (2021) 1119.

[106] R.W. Kolodinsky, R.A. Giacalone and C.L. Jurkiewicz, J. Bus. Ethics, **81(2)** (2008) 465.

[107] H. Endratno, W.R. Adawiyah and R. Purnomo, Journal of Behavioral Science, **18(3)** (2023) 17.

[108] N. Garg, S. Kumari and B.K. Punia, South Asian Journal of Business Studies, **11(3)** (2022) 295.

[109] M. Lata and R. Chaudhary, J. Bus. Ethics, **174(3)** (2021) 645.

[110] M.S. Mahipalan and S. Muhammed, Vision, **23(1)** (2019) 80.

[111] R.A. Kernochan, D.W. Mccormick and J.A. White, J. Manage. Inquiry, **16(1)** (2007) 61-75.

[112] T. Wolf and B. Feldbauer-Durstmüller, Rev. Manag. Sci., **17(4)** (2023) 1147-1155.

[113] C. Murgia, I. Notarnicolahttps, G. Rocco and A. Stievano, Nurs. Ethics, **27(5)** (2020) 1327.

[114] C. Mabey, M. Conroy, K. Blakeley and S. de Marco, J. Bus. Ethics, **145(4)** (2017) 757.

[115] C. Daniel, I. Walsh and J. Mesmer-Magnus, Int. J. Manag. Rev., **24(4)** (2022) 654.

[116] V. Saroglou, Rev. Theol. Louvain, **34(4)** (2003) 473-504.